

City of Excelsior
Hennepin County, Minnesota

MINUTES
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 16, 2014

1. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Schmidt called the meeting to order at 7:01 p.m.

Commissioners Present: Bipes, Bolles, Brabec (arrived at 7:11 p.m.),
Macpherson, Nelson, Schmidt

Commissioners Absent: Finch

Also Present: City Planner Smith, Advisor Caron

2. AGENDA APPROVAL

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- a) Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting of June 17, 2014
- b) Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting of July 22, 2014
- c) Heritage Preservation Commission Special Meeting of August 14, 2014
- d) Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting of August 19, 2014

It was moved by Schmidt, seconded by Bipes, to approve all four sets of minutes as written. Approved unanimously.

4. CITIZEN REPORTS or COMMENTS

None

5. NEW BUSINESS

- a) Site Alteration Permit for Exterior Alterations at 420 Second Street --
Phillips Garage/M&M Auto Body, Tim Brandow

Smith stated that the building owner, Tim Brandow, intends to convert the building to a restaurant use and has signed a lease with a tenant. The building is known as the Phillips Garage, dating from 1915, which was Excelsior's first body shop and that use continued for 99 years, which may be the longest continuous use of a building in downtown Excelsior.

The proposed changes are to remove the canopy on the front facade to reveal the transom windows, which will be replaced, and remove the front ramp and replace the entrance with pedestrian doors. The

5. NEW BUSINESS

- a) Site Alteration Permit for Exterior Alterations at 420 Second Street --
Phillips Garage/M&M Auto Body, Tim Brandow - *Continued*

boarded up side windows will be replaced with new windows. Smith stated that none of the existing windows are original.

The proposal also calls for removing the ramp on the rear of the building, but keeping the opening in the same location with new doors. The rooftop ductwork and equipment will also be removed.

Smith reviewed the Secretary of the Interior standards that are applicable to these alterations. The proposal makes minimal alterations to accommodate the new use, removing mostly non-historic features added later, and the door openings will remain, though the driving ramps will be removed. The existing window openings will be retained so that distinctive historic features are not destroyed. Removal of the canopy and ductwork and addition of a deck at the rear also do not destroy significant historic features, since the new features are distinguishable from the original building and the deck can be removed in the future without damaging historic materials. Staff recommended approval of the proposed alterations.

Bipes asked about the age of the front ramp. Brandow stated that a similar ramp appears in a 1918 photo. Bolles stated that the front ramp was repoured in the 1990s. Brandow stated that he was interested in adding a patio and possible partial second story at some point in the future. Bolles stated that lowering the front walkway to allow safe pedestrian access for an adaptive reuse is an appropriate change to accommodate its conversion from a previous industrial use to a retail use, and he supports it. The proposed restaurant operator owns the day spa behind Dunn Brothers, and intends to feature an Asian fusion menu, with a planned opening in January or February of 2015. Commissioner Nelson asked about any future use of the roof. Mr. Brandow stated that a rooftop patio may be possible.

It was moved by Bolles, seconded by Schmidt, to approve the Site Alteration Permit as presented and as outlined by staff with the conditions noted in the report. Approved unanimously.

- b) Site Alteration Permit for Proposed Alterations at 436 Second Street --
Bennett Livery Building, Steve Pint

Smith stated that the new owner of the Bennett Brothers Livery Stable building is proposing exterior alterations to the structure, which was constructed in 1899 as a false front livery barn, the only example of this style remaining in Excelsior. The applicant proposes to replace the existing vinyl siding with wood vertical board and batten siding. The

5. NEW BUSINESS

- b) Site Alteration Permit for Proposed Alterations at 436 Second Street --
Bennett Livery Building, Steve Pint - *Continued*

proposal would add board and battens to the original front portion of the building approximately 12 inches apart and continue this siding around the entire building. Staff recommends that the applicant remove all shutters from the building, as they are not original and are not compatible with the style of the building. Staff also recommends replacing the fascia board trim under the front roofline to redefine the depth of the roofline and restore the front closer to its original appearance, and the applicant is agreeable to this change. The applicant proposes to paint all trim in white and repaint all other siding in Weston Flax color. The rear domed canopy will be replaced with a more consistent gable canopy style.

Smith reviewed the applicable standards. The proposal preserves the historic character of the property, including its character-defining front and roofline, locates the entrance where it was historically, and retains elements that have become significant over time, such as retention of the side walkway and the shake awning in front. Other proposed changes have been substantiated by historic photos, and there is no destruction of materials, features or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The proposal attempts to restore the building to its original appearance to the extent practicable, an historic paint color is being used, and deteriorated siding materials are being duplicated as closely as possible. The historically inappropriate shutters are also being removed. Staff recommended approval as compatible with the history of the building and district while improving the building's visual appearance.

Schmidt asked when the original horizontal lap siding was replaced with the vertical board and batten. Pint stated that he was not certain. Schmidt also asked about the box dormer on the roof and the contemporary palladian style front window. Pint stated that the prior owner stated that these were added sometime after 1978, perhaps in the early 1980s. The walkway and overhang were added prior to that. Commissioners asked the applicant about using horizontal lap siding as shown in the historical photographs. Pint stated that he has a plan for that style of siding, but is concerned that it would accentuate the long horizontal facade on the side. Bipes stated that this is akin to a recently approved HPC project on Water Street where later board and batten siding was removed and replaced with more original horizontal lap siding. Macpherson questioned whether the board and batten has been there long enough to obtain historic significance.

Nelson stated that she likes the idea of making the building more accessible. Pint stated that has been some restoration in the interior

5. NEW BUSINESS

- b) Site Alteration Permit for Proposed Alterations at 436 Second Street --
Bennett Livery Building, Steve Pint - *Continued*

for multiple tenants and the front storefront will be for a street level salon business. Pint stated that there is no proposal to change the windows. Much of the wood siding is deteriorated, and the windows are functional but need cosmetic work. Nelson stated that she supports one type of siding, not two.

Macpherson stated that the question at issue is whether the proposed alterations should be a historic restoration versus recognizing what has happened to the building over time. Schmidt noted that this is merely a proposal to address the siding and paint and the HPC should not overthink it. Brabec stated that she is concerned about the historic appearance of the front door and making sure that it is appropriate. Pint stated that he has located a reclaimed door that he intends to use if available, in a mission style, with a honey color, which he believes will enhance the building's appearance.

Macpherson asked about the shake roof. Pint stated that he will be replacing the old with new cedar shakes. Pint also stated that the reclaimed front door might not be available because it is a salvage item that he has not yet secured, in which case he might build something with a similar appearance. The Commission proposed using a subcommittee to review the door style for appropriateness.

It was moved by Schmidt, seconded by Bipes, to approve the Site Alteration Permit consistent with the staff recommendation, with the caveat that a subcommittee should review the final front door style selected for compatibility, consisting of Nelson, Brabec and Macpherson. Bolles clarified that the roofline definition should be referred to as frieze board, not fascia, and believes that horizontal lap siding is more appropriate. Approved unanimously.

6. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

- a) Review of PUD Ordinance Amendments

Schmidt stated that he has not adequately read the materials and is not prepared to discuss this item at this time. Schmidt moved to continue discussion to the next meeting, seconded by Bipes. Approved unanimously.

7. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

- a) Scenic Byway
- b) Designate Liaison for Planning Commission Meeting- October 7, 2014

Staff agreed to email a reminder of the next Planning Commission meeting so that anyone interested may attend.

- c) Next Meeting- Tuesday, October 21, 2014
- d) Site Alteration Permits Administratively Approved

None

8. MISCELLANEOUS/COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

Smith reported that the Teen Clinic building is proposing to remove the rear addition and divide the lot, with a future building to be constructed at the rear on the existing parking lot, with a shared parking lot in between the structures.

- a) Recent City Council Actions

Smith stated that the Council moved to reconsider its earlier decision on the Martin's rooftop addition, then reversed its position and upheld the staff appeal, passed a moratorium on rooftop additions, and indicated that it would appoint a five-member task force to work on revising the HPC ordinance program for preservation. He distributed a timeline for comment. The Commission indicated they would defer to staff's recommendation on which consultant should be used and advised leaving some extra time at the end of the process for city/public consideration before the moratorium expires. Also, a space needs assessment is being undertaken for the city hall/library building and firms are being interviewed by the Council. The Excelsior Brewery's requested Sunday hours were also approved.

9. ADJOURNMENT

It was moved by Nelson, seconded by Brabec, to adjourn. Approved unanimously. Adjourned at 8:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tim Caron
Recording Secretary