

City of Excelsior
Hennepin County, Minnesota

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 2, 2014

1. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Chair Schmidt called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m.

Commissioners Present: Bolles, Brabec, Finch, Macpherson, Schmidt

Commissioners Absent: Nelson

Also Present: City Planner Smith, Advisor Caron

2. NEW BUSINESS

a) Amendment to Site Alteration Permit for 436 Second Street -- Bennett Livery Building

Smith stated that the HPC at its last meeting had approved a Site Alteration Permit for this project to install board and batten style siding on the entire structure. After discussions between the applicant and City staff, the applicant is now proposing to install horizontal lap siding on the main structure, and board and batten siding on the rear addition and roof dormer. The proposal would also replace 3 windows on the ground floor at grade along the east elevation and add a "livery stable" sign on the upper front facade and a mural and tenant sign 8 feet tall along the east property line.

The applicant, Steve Pint, stated that adding a front door will cause the loss of tenant signage for the building, so he wished to add a flat board sign on the site that will allow the tenants to have business sign visibility. Brabec and Bolles expressed concern with the proposed size of the sign. Schmidt suggested that the sign might present historical information regarding the building, rather than a scenic mural, the subject and style of which is undefined at this time.

Bolles asked about the type of paint to be used on the mural. Pint stated that it had not been determined yet. Schmidt asked the Commission to discuss each element in sequence in order to move ahead. Brabec asked about the front door, and whether it had been procured yet. Pint stated that he had not yet secured the reclaimed door that was discussed at the last meeting. Bolles asked about the exposure of the lap siding. Pint stated that the reveal of the siding should be as it was originally, since some of the siding still exists on the east side of the building, and it is approximately 4 inches wide. The Commission clarified that the proposal is to replace the vertical siding on the entirety of the original main structure from board and

2. NEW BUSINESS

a) Amendment to Site Alteration Permit for 436 Second Street -- Bennett Livery Building

batten to lap siding with a reveal similar to the historical lap siding shown in historical photographs, and the remainder of the rear addition and dormer would be board and batten siding.

The Commission discussed that the grade level windows on the southeast side could be changed as proposed due to drainage issues as these were located on a secondary elevation with limited visibility from a public way. The applicant was asked about the palladian style window in the front which is not original to the structure and whether it could potentially be removed entirely or replaced with a rectangular window. Macpherson noted that the window does not architecturally fit the concept and would look more authentic without the top rounded pane. Bolles stated that removing the window might adversely impact the natural light in the interior. Pint stated that removal of the window might not affect the usability of the space as it was being significantly renovated on the interior. Finch stated that a rectangle window could be expanded to the same height as the existing window if additional light was necessary, at the applicant's option. Bolles commented that the window style should at a minimum blend with the other front windows and the proposed front door grill pattern, but it is preferable to remove the window entirely, if possible.

The Commission noted that installation of the livery stable sign was fine, as it was supported by a historical antecedent in the photographic record of the building. Pint stated that the reason for the mural sign is both to cover the adjacent building side wall and to replace tenant signage that is being eliminated from the front of the building. Brabec stated again that she was very concerned about the size of this sign.

It was moved by Finch, seconded by Macpherson, to approve the amendment of the Site Alteration Permit to accommodate the proposed changes to the siding, adding the livery signage, and elimination of the grade level windows and palladian window, or its replacement with a similarly sized rectangular window, at the option of the applicant, with the HPC's preference for removal; it was clarified with the applicant that the 8-10 inch frieze board along the front roofline would still be present, despite its omission from the plan illustration; approved unanimously.

The Commission briefly reviewed its jurisdiction over site signage. Commissioners provided feedback that there was concern about the overall size of the sign and that the applicant might consider reflecting the livery building in any imagery. Pint stated that there is not an urgent need to get approval for the signage so he will come back to a future meeting.

2. NEW BUSINESS

- b) Site Alteration Permit for Second Story Addition for 212 Water Street -
- Wheeler Building/Martin's

Smith stated that no action on this agenda item is required since the application has been formally withdrawn. He stated that within the next month a committee will be established and starting to meet to discuss rooftop additions during the moratorium, which he expected to consist of Mayor Gaylord, Schmidt and Macpherson from the HPC, and Planning Commissioners Craig and Wallace.

3. ADJOURNMENT

It was moved by Finch, seconded by Brabec, to adjourn. Approved unanimously. Adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tim Caron
Recording Secretary