

City of Excelsior
Hennepin County, Minnesota

Minutes
Heritage Preservation Commission

Tuesday, March 18, 2014

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Schmidt called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Bolles, Brabec, Nelson, MacPherson, and Chair Schmidt

Commissioners Absent: Bipes, Finch

Also Present: City Planner Smith

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a) Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting of February 25, 2014

Commissioner Bolles moved, Commissioner MacPherson seconded, to approve the Heritage Preservation Commission Minutes of February 25, 2014. Motion carried 5/0.

4. CITIZEN REPORTS or COMMENTS

a) None

5. NEW BUSINESS

a) Second Floor Addition to 212 Water Street (Martin's Women's Apparel Building)

Smith introduced the Second Floor Addition to 212 Water St (Martin's Women's Apparel Building). The applicants have submitted a Sketch Plan to solicit the HPC's response to a possible second story addition to their one-story building.

Commissioner Macpherson stated that the building, as designed and built, is now two buildings. If a second story is added on the second building, it would need to look the same. 212 and 216 Water Street were constructed as one building. Heights differ in back, but may be added onto after built. What consideration do we need to put into our discussion so that future additions to 216 would be compatible to this project?

Johnsons are the owners of 216 Water Street.

Chair Schmidt stated we are embarking on uncharted waters.

5. NEW BUSINESS

- a) Second Floor Addition to 212 Water Street (Martin's Women's Apparel Building) - *Continued*

Commissioner Macpherson said we are looking at setting precedent with this project. What appears as two buildings is actually one building.

Commissioner Bolles stated that we should note Commissioner Macpherson's point. May want to add a condition that any other roof top addition would match this one if approved.

Chair Schmidt stated we don't have point by point comparison of how this project meets standards.

Martin, the applicant, stated that we have had several meetings with staff to get direction. If some tweaking has to be done, he would like to know.

Martin stated he received a legal opinion and talked to adjacent property owner. Was advised that he has right to build roof top addition even though it may block existing windows on the adjacent building.

Commissioner Nelson stated that the HPC can't really judge a speculated building.

Smith went through the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation for additions onto historic buildings.

Commissioner Bolles stated that the HPC at times has not followed the standards.

Commissioner Finch provided comments via email that the proposed project does not meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Commissioner Nelson stated that standards are grey. Trying to be more rigorous may not be useful.

Commissioner Brabec stated that she would prefer it to be setback more than proposed.

Commissioner Bolles stated that he would agree. Have the ability to move the front wall back further. The further back the building is there's not much of a problem for any future. If we approve a 3-foot setback would be difficult to deny 3 foot setbacks in the future.

The applicant, Martin, stated that having it setback looks too modern.

5. NEW BUSINESS

- a) Second Floor Addition to 212 Water Street (Martin's Women's Apparel Building) - *Continued*

Commissioner Macpherson stated that we need to give guidelines to the plans present. Not enough detail to approve the building.

Commissioner Brabec stated that the parapet design is over-looming by a tich.

Commissioner Bolles stated if we approve this with the bump up would be disappointed if an adjacent building didn't include it. Would be comfortable with the name on the parapet but without the bump.

Commissioner Nelson noted that the Minnetonka Music (IOOF) building has a lot of detail. Commissioner Nelson would like to see this in the entire street context would be useful.

Commissioner Brabec likes that the addition would be a new entity.

Commissioner Nelson stated that awnings help characterize the town as a tourist town. Would like to see more context with the street.

Commissioner Bolles believes that the addition should not detract from the historic building. Second floor should be more subdued than the original.

Commissioner Macpherson noted that the bump up on the cornice may be too high. Going with a blander brick than the iron-spot brick, as proposed. May want to bring a plan that eliminates it, as well.

Chair Schmidt noted that the HPC should worry about the other building when and if it ever is proposed. Likes the look of the parapet but it does stand out and may be detracting from the existing building.

Scott McGinnis – lives in Chanhassen. Was on the Excelsior HPC. The Corn Exchange building in Minneapolis has a two story addition. Doesn't have a setback but is still clearly differentiated.

Chair Schmidt agrees that they should be compatible.

Scott McGinnis - Doesn't oppose a rooftop addition. Second story on 212 would have an impact on 216 Water Street.

Commissioner Macpherson stated there's a limit on how much you can set back and still have a viable project.

Martin again stated that leaving it open looks too contemporary.

5. NEW BUSINESS

- a) Second Floor Addition to 212 Water Street (Martin's Women's Apparel Building) - *Continued*

Commissioner Nelson stated that there are a number of buildings that are ripe for a second floor in the downtown. Would like to continue this discussion.

Chair Schmidt doesn't like setback at all.

Commissioner Brabec asked if the HPC should follow standards or do what we want.

Commissioner Macpherson asked the applicant if he could you bring back a plan that has a 10-foot setback and one with a small setback. If the cap of the original building is changed, hopefully, the cap of the next door building also changes.

Commissioner Nelson would like to see drawings with more context. Minnetonka Music (IOOF) building down the street is more elaborate. Would like to see more options from the architect to see what is the more appropriate setback. Buildings with two floors look more polished.

Commissioner Bolles would be reluctant to over embellish the second floor. Oddfellows building has the most embellishing of any building in town.

Commissioner Nelson stated Excelsior has a whimsical roofline which is part of excelsior's charm.

Martin stated they are trying to blend in; don't want to stand out.

Chair Schmidt stated we are writing a standards/guidelines for other second story buildings.

John Monson – came to listen. Will be effected more than anyone. Will lose windows on southwest facade. Understands that he doesn't have right for **them. Agree that façade should not be setback.** Building isn't to scale to give it differentiation. Asked where Martin is showing new parking space blocks Monson's entrance. Not sure if a residential use near pubs is a good idea.

Chair Schmidt stated that to have it setback and look different at all would be contrary to district.

Commissioner Brabec wouldn't support replication.

Commissioner Bolles doesn't like addition to look drastically different.

5. NEW BUSINESS

- a) Second Floor Addition to 212 Water Street (Martin's Women's Apparel Building) - *Continued*

Commissioner Macpherson is pretty fine with how it is. Some modification to the parapet and soffit.

Commissioner Nelson likes harmony. A building that blends in is best. Look forward to an elegant second floor addition.

- b) Letter to School Board

Commissioner Macpherson would like to send a letter to the school board instead of staff. Chair Schmidt stated that the HPC needed to explain benefits of designation to the school board. Commissioner Brabec moved, Commissioner Nelson seconded, for Smith to put Commissioner Macpherson's draft letter on City letterhead for Chair Schmidt to sign. Motion carried 5/0.

- c) 2014 State Historic Preservation Conference

Apply for two scholarships. Commissioners Brabec and Nelson expressed interest in attending the conference. Commissioner Macpherson moved, Commissioner Bolles seconded, for the Commission to apply for two scholarships to the 2014 State Historic Preservation Conference. Motion carried 5/0.

- d) Excelsior's HPC's Representative to Hennepin County Historical Society (verbal report)

Commissioner Macpherson moved, Commissioner Brabec seconded, for Nelson to join the Hennepin County Historical Society to fulfill the City's Certified Local Government requirement. Smith confirmed that the City will pay for the membership. Motion carried 5/0.

6. ANNUAL MEETING

- a) Election of Officers – Chair, Vice-Chair, and Secretary

Commissioner Bolles moved, Commissioner Nelson seconded, to nominate Schmidt for Chair. No other nominations. Schmidt was reappointed Chair. Motion carried 5/0.

Chair Schmidt nominated Commissioner Macpherson for Vice-Chair. No other nominations. Macpherson was re-appointed Vice-Chair. Motion carried 5/0. Commissioner Macpherson nominated Commissioner Brabec for Secretary.

6. ANNUAL MEETING

- a) Election of Officers – Chair, Vice-Chair, and Secretary - *Continued*
No other nominations. Commissioner Brabec was re-appointed Secretary.
Motion carried 5/0.
- b) Review of By-Laws
Commissioner Macpherson moved, Commissioner Bolles seconded, to keep the By-Laws without any changes. Motion carried 5/0.
- c) Finalize Goals and Objectives for 2014
Goals to have inspection before occupancy. MN - Figure out how to do this.
- d) Code of Conduct and Decorum for Appointed Officials
All reviewed.

7. COMMUNICATIONS and REPORT

- a) Exploring Grant Funds for Oak Hill Cemetery
- b) Possibility of Historically Designating Portions of Excelsior Elementary School
- c) Scenic Byway
- d) Designate Liaison for Planning Commission Meeting – April 8, 2014
Schmidt volunteered.
- e) Site Alteration Permits Administratively Approved - None
- f) Next Meeting – Tuesday, April 22, 2014
- g) Joint CC/HPC meeting – Monday April 7 @ 6 pm

8. MISCELLANEOUS/COMMISSIONER'S COMMENTS

- a) Recent City Council Actions
Smith informed the Commission of recent City Council actions.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Macpherson moved, Commissioner Brabec seconded, to adjourn the meeting at 9:25 p.m. Motion carried 5/0.

Respectfully submitted,

Patrick Smith
City Planner